

Is Self-Insurance Right for You?

With the passage of the Affordable Care Act (“ACA”) and rising insurance costs, many mid-market sized plan sponsors are exploring the switch from insured to self-insured medical plans. During this process, plan sponsors will need to evaluate their appetite for risk and to navigate, for the first time, the maze of terms and conditions within a medical stop-loss contract. Self-insurance is usually best suited for plan sponsors with the financial wherewithal to absorb variable claim payment streams.

Under a traditional insured medical plan, there is a true risk transfer. The plan sponsor pays a premium and in return, the insurance company assumes 100% of the risk. Under a self-insured plan, the plan sponsor assumes 100% of the risk. However, to mitigate this claims risk, plan sponsors usually purchase Stop-loss Insurance. This insurance can protect the plan sponsor from a catastrophic claim on an individual participant (“Individual or Specific Stop-Loss”) or total claims in excess of the expected or budgeted amount (“Aggregate Stop-Loss”). While stop-loss insurance mitigates the plan sponsor’s risk, it is not first dollar coverage (i.e., the insurance company only pays claims after the plan sponsor has absorbed a portion of the claim, i.e., the deductible). One leading Stop-Loss underwriter suggests setting the Individual Stop-Loss (“ISL”) deductible at 5% to 15% of the group’s total expected claims. Using this rule of thumb and assuming a \$12,000 claim cost per employee, the chart below shows recommended ISL levels for groups in the middle market.

# of Covered Employees	Minimum ISL Deductible	Maximum ISL Deductible
100-149	\$75,000	\$150,000
150-199	100,000	200,000
200-249	125,000	250,000
250-499	150,000	300,000

Depending on one’s appetite for risk, a plan sponsor can choose from the minimum ISL deductible shown (higher premium cost and greater risk transfer), maximum ISL deductible (lower premium cost and lesser risk transfer), or a level in between. With regard to Aggregate Stop-Loss (“ASL”), the most common deductible amount is 125% of expected claims. Thus, if expected claims were \$2 million and actual claims came in at \$3 million, the plan sponsor would pay the first \$2.5 million (125% of \$2 million) and the insurance company would pay the remaining \$500,000.

Some of the advantages of self-insurance

- Potential for increased cash flow if actual claims are less than expected claims.
- The ability to hold the money associated with Incurred But Not Reported (“IBNR”) claims. These reserves are held by the insurance company under an insured plan and can represent 15-20% of paid claims. For a group with \$2 million in expected claims, switching to self-insurance can result in a cash flow advantage of \$300,000 to \$400,000 in the first year.
- Avoidance of state insured mandated benefits. In New Jersey, some experts have pegged the additional costs associated with mandated benefits at 4%-8% of premium. Of course, plan sponsors can continue with these benefits if they so desire.
- Lower expense levels since state premium taxes and ACA insurance company taxes are eliminated. This could result in a 5% cost reduction.
- Increased access to claims data since you will receive claims data every time you need to fund your claim account.

Some of the disadvantages of self-insurance

- The plan sponsor is taking on additional risk if claims exceed budgeted levels.
- A separate bank account is established to pay claims, usually on a weekly basis. Thus, there is additional administration.
- Under a self-insured plan, the plan sponsor now becomes the claims fiduciary under ERISA. There may be ways to mitigate this risk through paying an additional fee to your administrator.
- Stop-loss coverage which needs to be purchased is complex and could create gaps in coverage.

For plan sponsors who would like to “dip their toe” in the pool of self-insurance, there are various insurance companies in the marketplace that offer “level funding” products which offer some of the best aspects of traditional insurance with those of self-insurance.

If you have any questions about this article, please contact James DiOrio at Bankers Cooperative Group, Inc. (908)272-8500 x606 or jdiorio@bankerscoopgroup.com.

Established in 1982, Bankers Cooperative Group, Inc. (BCG) is the self contained brokerage facility for members and associate members of the New Jersey Bankers Association (NJBankers). Today, BCG is the leading provider of employee benefit programs for New Jersey’s banking industry. As administrator of the New Jersey Bankers Association sponsored Employee Benefits Trust (EBT), BCG is able to leverage almost 8,000 industry employees and their dependents to negotiate group employee benefit programs and pricing not generally attainable on an individual employer basis. The “Cooperative” in our name is what sets BCG apart from the competition. Since 1998, BCG has returned \$3.1 million in patronage dividends to its shareholders and EBT participants.

